

New York State Board for Professional Medical Conduct

433 River Street, Suite 303 • Troy, New York 12180-2299 • (518) 402-0863

Antonia C. Novello, M.D.,M.P.H., Dr. P.H. Commissioner NYS Department of Health

Dennis P. Whalen
Executive Deputy Commissioner
NYS Department of Health

Dennis J. Graziano, Director
Office of Professional Medical Conduct

William P. Dillon, M.D. Chair

Denise M. Bolan, R.P.A. Vice Chair

Ansel R. Marks, M.D., J.D. Executive Secretary

September 3, 2002

CERTIFIED MAIL-RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

John G. Livingston, M.D. 101 Waterman Avenue Rumson, New Jersey 07760

RE:

License No. 101250

Dear Dr. Livingston:

Enclosed please find Order #BPMC 02-279 of the New York State Board for Professional Medical Conduct. This Order and any penalty provided therein goes into effect September 3, 2002.

If the penalty imposed by the Order is a surrender, revocation or suspension of this license, you are required to deliver to the Board the license and registration within five (5) days of receipt of the Order to Board for Professional Medical Conduct, New York State Department of Health, Hedley Park Place, Suite 303, 433 River Street, Troy, New York 12180.

50

Ansel R. Marks, M.D., J.D.

Executive Secretary

Board for Professional Medical Conduct

Enclosure

cc:

Sharif Mahdavian, Esq. Friedman and Mahdavian

The Bar Building

36 W. 44th Street, Suite 1205

New York, NY 10036

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH STATE BOARD FOR PROFESSIONAL MEDICAL CONDUCT

IN THE MATTER OF JOHN G. LIVINGSTON, M.D.

ORDER
BPMC No. 02-279

Upon the application of (Respondent) JOHN G. LIVINGSTON, M.D. in the attached Consent Agreement and Order, which is made a part of this Consent Order, it is

ORDERED, that the Consent Agreement, and its terms, are adopted and SO ORDERED, and it is further

ORDERED, that this Order shall be effective upon issuance by the Board, either

- by mailing of a copy of this Consent Order, either by first class mail to
 Respondent at the address in the attached Consent Agreement or by certified mail to Respondent's attorney, OR
- upon facsimile transmission to Respondent or Respondent's attorney,
 Whichever is first.

SO ORDERED.

DATED: 8/30/02

Chair
State Board for Professional Medical Conduct

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH STATE BOARD FOR PROFESSIONAL MEDICAL CONDUCT

IN THE MATTER OF

JOHN G. LIVINGSTON, M.D.

CONSENT
AGREEMENT
AND
ORDER

JOHN G. LIVINGSTON, M.D., representing that all of the following statements are true, deposes and says:

That on or about June 11, 1968, I was licensed to practice as a physician in the State of New York, and issued License No. 101250 by the New York State Education Department.

My current address is 101 Waterman Avenue, Rumson, New Jersey 07760, and I will advise the Director of the Office of Professional Medical Conduct of any change of address.

I understand that the New York State Board for Professional Medical Conduct has charged me with one specification of professional misconduct.

A copy of the Statement of Charges, marked as Exhibit "A", is attached to and part of this Consent Agreement.

I do not contest the First Specification in full satisfaction of the charges against me and agree to the following penalty:

Pursuant to §230-a(2) of the Public Health law, my license to practice medicine in the State of New York shall be suspended for a period of 36 months, with the first five months a period of actual suspension and the last 31 months a period of stayed suspension. Pursuant to §230-a(9) of the Public Health Law, upon the conclusion of the period of actual suspension, I shall be placed on probation for a period of 60 months, subject to the terms in attached Exhibit "B".

I further agree that the Consent Order shall impose the following conditions:

That Respondent shall maintain current registration of licensure with the New York State Education Department Division of Professional Licensing Services (except during periods of actual suspension), and shall pay all registration fees. This condition shall take effect thirty (30) days after the Consent Order's effective date and will continue so long as Respondent remains licensed in New York State; and

That Respondent shall cooperate fully with the Office of Professional Medical Conduct (OPMC) in its administration and enforcement of this Order and in its investigations of matters concerning Respondent. Respondent shall respond in a timely manner to all OPMC requests for written periodic verification of Respondent's compliance with this Order. Respondent shall meet with a person designated by the Director of OPMC, as directed. Respondent shall respond promptly and provide all documents and information within Respondent's control, as directed. This condition shall take effect upon the Board's issuance of the Consent Order and will continue so long as Respondent remains licensed in New York State.

I stipulate that my failure to comply with any conditions of this Order shall constitute misconduct as defined by New York State Education Law §6530(29).

I agree that if I am charged with professional misconduct in future, this

Consent Agreement and Order **shall** be admitted into evidence in that proceeding.

I ask the Board to adopt this Consent Agreement.

I understand that if the Board does not adopt this Consent Agreement, none of its terms shall bind me or constitute an admission of any of the acts of alleged misconduct; this Consent Agreement shall not be used against me in any way and shall be kept in strict confidence; and the Board's denial shall be without prejudice to the pending disciplinary proceeding and the Board's final determination pursuant to the Public Health Law.

I agree that, if the Board adopts this Consent Agreement, the Chair of the Board shall issue a Consent Order in accordance with its terms. I agree that this Order shall take effect upon its issuance by the Board, either by mailing of a copy of the Consent Order by first class mail to me at the address in this Consent Agreement, or to my attorney by certified mail, OR upon facsimile transmission to me or my attorney, whichever is first.

I ask the Board to adopt this Consent Agreement of my own free will and not under duress, compulsion or restraint. In consideration of the value to me of the Board's adoption of this Consent Agreement, allowing me to resolve this matter without the various risks and burdens of a hearing on the merits, I knowingly waive my right to contest the Consent Order for which I apply, whether administratively or judicially, I agree to be bound by the Consent Order, and ask that the Board adopt this Consent Agreement.

DATED 7/17/02

The undersigned agree to Respondent's attached Consent Agreement and to its proposed penalty, terms and conditions.

SHARIF MAHDAVIÁN, E Attorney for Respondent

Associate Counsel
Bureau of Professional Medical Conduct

DENNIS J. GRAZIANO
Director
Office of Professional Medical Conduct

EXHIBIT "A"

NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH STATE BOARD FOR PROFESSIONAL MEDICAL CONDUCT

IN THE MATTER

OF

JOHN G. LIVINGSTON, M.D.

STATEMENT OF CHARGES

JOHN G. LIVINGSTON, M.D., the Respondent, was authorized to practice medicine in New York State on or about June 11, 1968, by the issuance of license number 101250 by the New York State Education Department.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

A. On repeated occasions during the period from in or about November 2000 through in or about January 2001, Respondent engaged in inappropriate contact with Patient A.

SPECIFICATION OF CHARGES FIRST SPECIFICATION NEGLIGENCE ON MORE THAN ONE OCCASION

Respondent is charged with committing professional misconduct as defined in N.Y. Educ. Law §6530(3) by practicing the profession of medicine with negligence on more than one occasion as alleged in the facts of:

1. Paragraph A.

DATED:

June , 2002 New York, New York

Roy Nemerson Deputy Counsel Bureau of Professional Medical Conduct

EXHIBIT "B"

Terms of Probation

- 1. Respondent's conduct shall conform to moral and professional standards of conduct and governing law. Any act of professional misconduct by Respondent as defined by New York State Education Law §6530 or §6531 shall constitute a violation of probation and may subject Respondent to an action pursuant to New York State Public Health Law §230(19).
- 2. Respondent shall provide the Director, Office of Professional Medical Conduct (OPMC), Hedley Park Place, 433 River Street Suite 303, Troy, New York 12180-2299 with the following information, in writing, and ensure that such information is kept current: a full description of Respondent's employment and practice; all professional and residential addresses and telephone numbers within and outside New York State; and all investigations, charges, convictions or disciplinary actions by any local, state or federal agency, institution or facility, within thirty (30) days of each action.
- 3. Respondent shall cooperate fully with, and respond in a timely manner to, OPMC requests to provide written periodic verification of Respondent's compliance with the terms of this Consent Order. Upon the Director of OPMC's request, Respondent shall meet in person with the Director's designee.
- 4. Respondent's failure to pay any monetary penalty by the prescribed date shall subject Respondent to all provisions of law relating to debt collection by New York State, including but not limited to: the imposition of interest, late payment charges and collection fees; referral to the New York State Department of Taxation and Finance for collection; and non-renewal of permits or licenses [Tax Law section 171(27)]; State Finance Law section 18; CPLR section 5001; Executive Law section 32].
- The probation period shall toll when Respondent is not engaged in active medical practice in New York State for a period of thirty (30) consecutive days or more. Respondent shall notify the Director of OPMC, in writing, if Respondent is not currently engaged in, or intends to leave, active medical practice in New York State for a consecutive thirty (30) day period. Respondent shall then notify the Director again at least fourteen (14) days before returning to active practice. Upon Respondent's return to active practice in New York State, the probation period will resume and Respondent shall fulfill any unfulfilled probation terms.
- 6. The Director of OPMC may review Respondent's professional performance. This review may include but shall not be limited to: a review of office records, patient records and/or hospital charts; and interviews with or periodic visits with Respondent and Respondent's staff at practice locations or OPMC offices.
- 7. Respondent shall maintain complete and legible medical records that accurately reflect the evaluation and treatment of patients and contain all information required by State rules and regulations concerning controlled substances.
- 8. Respondent shall remain drug/alcohol free.

- 9. Respondent shall remain active in self help groups such as, but not limited to, Narcotics Anonymous, Alcoholics Anonymous and Caduceus.
- 10. Respondent shall notify all treating physicians of his history of alcohol/chemical dependency. Respondent shall advise OPMC of any controlled or mood-altering substance given or prescribed by treating physicians.
- 11. Respondent shall practice only when monitored by qualified health care professional monitors (sobriety monitor, practice monitor, and therapist) proposed by Respondent and approved, in writing, by the Director of OPMC. Monitors shall not be family members or personal friends, or be in professional relationships which would pose a conflict with monitoring responsibilities.
- 12. Respondent shall ensure that the monitors are familiar with Respondent's drug/alcohol dependency and with the terms of this Order. Respondent shall cause the monitors to report any deviation from compliance with the terms of this Order to OPMC. Respondent shall cause the monitors to submit required reports on a timely basis.
- 13. Respondent shall submit, at the request of a monitor, to random, unannounced observed blood, breath and/or urine screens for the presence of drugs/alcohol. This monitoring will be on a random, unannounced seven-days a week, twenty-four hours a day basis. Respondent shall report for a drug/alcohol screen within four (4) hours of being contacted by the monitor. The sobriety monitor shall obtain drug/alcohol screens at a frequency of no less than six times per month for the first 12 months of the period of monitoring. In the event that Respondent has been compliant through the first 12 month period, drug/alcohol screens shall be thereafter obtained a ta frequency to be proposed by the sobriety monitor and approved by OPMC. Respondent shall cause the monitor to report to OPMC within 24 hours if a test is refused or delayed by Respondent or a test is positive for any unauthorized substance.
- 14. Respondent shall meet with a sobriety monitor on a regular basis who will submit quarterly reports to OPMC certifying Respondent's sobriety. These reports are to include a) forensically valid results of all drug/alcohol monitoring tests to be performed and b) an assessment of self-help group attendance (e.g., AA/NA/Caduceus, etc.), 12 step progress, etc. The sobriety monitor shall acknowledge willingness to comply with the monitoring by executing the acknowledgment provided by OPMC.
- Within thirty days of the effective date of the order, Respondent shall practice medicine only when monitored by a licensed physician, board certified in an appropriate specialty, ("practice monitor") proposed by Respondent and subject to the written approval of the Director of OPMC.
 - a. Respondent shall make available to the monitor any and all records or access to the practice requested by the monitor, including on-site observation. The practice monitor shall visit Respondent's medical practice at each and every location, on a random unannounced basis at least monthly and shall review Respondent's practice regarding the prescribing, administering, dispensing, inventorying, and disposal of controlled substances, and shall examine a selection (no fewer than 20) of records maintained by Respondent, including patient records, prescribing information and office records. The review will determine whether the Respondent's medical practice is conducted in accordance

with the generally accepted standards of professional medical care. Any perceived deviation of accepted standards of medical care or refusal to cooperate with the monitor shall be reported within 24 hours to OPMC.

- b. Respondent shall be solely responsible for all expenses associated with monitoring, including fees, if any, to the monitoring physician.
- c. Respondent shall cause the practice monitor to report quarterly, in writing, to the Director of OPMC regarding the quality of Respondent's medical practice, including the evaluation and treatment of patients, physical and mental condition, time and attendance or any unexplained absences from work, prescribing practices, and compliance or failure to comply with any term of probation.
- d. Respondent shall maintain medical malpractice insurance coverage with limits no less than \$2 million per occurrence and \$6 million per policy year, in accordance with Section 230(18)(b) of the Public Health Law. Proof of coverage shall be submitted to the Director of OPMC prior to Respondent's practice after the effective date of this Order.
- 16. Respondent shall continue in counseling or other therapy with a therapist as long as the therapist determines is necessary, or for the period of time dictated in the Order.
- 17. Respondent shall cause the therapist to submit a proposed treatment plan and quarterly reports to OPMC certifying whether Respondent is in compliance with the treatment plan. Respondent shall cause the therapist to report to OPMC within 24 hours if Respondent leaves treatment against medical advice, or displays any symptoms of a suspected or actual relapse.
- 18. Respondent shall comply with any request from OPMC to obtain an independent psychiatric/chemical dependency evaluation by a health care professional proposed by the Respondent and approved, in writing, by the Director of OPMC.
- 19. Respondent shall enroll in and complete a continuing education program, to include continuing medical education (CME) in the areas of medical ethics and boundary violations. This CME program is subject to the Director of OPMC's prior written approval and shall be completed within the first year of the probation period.
- 20. Respondent shall comply with this Order and all its terms, and shall bear all associated compliance costs. Upon receiving evidence of noncompliance with, or violation of, these terms, the Director of OPMC and/or the Board may initiate a violation of probation proceeding, and/or any other such proceeding authorized by law, against Respondent.